

From: ACohen <acohen@healtheffects.org>
Sent: Thursday, July 06, 2017 12:08 PM
To: James E. Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Cc: ACohen <acohen@healtheffects.org>; Dan Greenbaum <DGreenbaum@healtheffects.org>; Rashid Shaikh <RShaikh@healtheffects.org>
Subject: Re: Request for Analysis of PM2.5 and Mortality in ACS CPS II Cohort
Importance: High

Dear Dr. Enstrom,

I am writing with regard to your email of June 15, 2017 below. Although I did not personally respond to your email of March 10, 2017, which was addressed to Dan Greenbaum and me, Dan Greenbaum did respond on March 17, 2017 (attached) and in follow-up emails and telephone conversations on behalf of HEI, and on my behalf as a formerly full-time HEI employee.

I also want to clarify the issue of my “special access” to ACS data to conduct the further analyses you request. Co-investigators on ACS-approved research projects are not authorized to conduct any analyses other than those that comprised the original research proposal.

Best regards,

Aaron J Cohen MPH, DSc

Consulting Scientist | Health Effects Institute | 75 Federal Street Suite 1400 | Boston, MA 02110-1817 | USA

Affiliate Professor of Global Health | Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation | University of Washington

Phone: +1-617-488-2325 | Mobile: +1-857-891-6580 | FAX: +1-617-488-2335

acohen@healtheffects.org | <http://www.healtheffects.org> | <http://www.healthdata.org/>

From: James Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Date: Thursday, June 15, 2017 at 2:00 PM
To: Aaron Cohen <acohen@healtheffects.org>
Cc: Michelle Turner <mturner@uottawa.ca>, Aaron Yeow <Yeow.Aaron@epa.gov>, "Sacks, Jason" <Sacks.Jason@epa.gov>, 'Mary Ross' <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>, 'Zackary Pekar' <Pekar.Zackary@epa.gov>
Subject: Request for Analysis of PM2.5 and Mortality in ACS CPS II Cohort

June 15, 2017
Aaron J. Cohen, D.Sc.
HEI Principal Scientist
acohen@healtheffects.org

Dear Dr. Cohen,

You have not responded to my [March 10, 2017 email message](#) and Dr. Michelle C. Turner has not responded to my May 26, 2017 email message below. However, since you two are the lead authors on the April 1, 2017 *Environmental Research* article based on CPS II data, it is clear that you both have special access to CPS II data as per the ICMJE "Uniform Requirements." Thus, you must conduct the analyses that I requested on my March 10 and May 26 and send me your findings by June 30, 2017.

I am informing four EPA PM2.5 experts (Aaron Yeow, Jason Sacks, Mary Ross, and Zackary Pekar) of my above request and I hope that they will encourage you to confirm or refute my strong evidence of NO relationship between PM2.5 and total mortality in the CPS II cohort. Also, several critics of PM2.5 epidemiology, including myself, are convincing the leadership of EPA of the need to entirely reassess the PM2.5 NAAQS. Ideally, EPA will impose a freeze on PM2.5 regulations until this reassessment has been completed. Such a freeze has just been implemented regarding [EPA ozone regulations](#).

Thank you very much for your cooperation.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.

UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

jenstrom@ucla.edu

From: James E. Enstrom [<mailto:jenstrom@ucla.edu>]

Sent: Friday, May 26, 2017 1:26 PM

To: 'Michelle C. Turner' <[mtturner@uottawa.ca](mailto:mturner@uottawa.ca)>

Subject: Request for Analysis of PM2.5 and Mortality in ACS CPS II Cohort

May 26, 2017

Michelle C. Turner, Ph.D.

HEI Research Report 140 Seventh Co-Author

McLaughlin Centre for Population Health Risk Assessment, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada

Barcelona Institute for Global Health (ISGlobal), Barcelona, Spain

Universitat Pompeu Fabra (UPF), Barcelona, Spain

CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP), Madrid, Spain

mtturner@uottawa.ca

Dear Dr. Turner,

I note that your 2004 University of Ottawa MSc Dissertation and your 2012 University of Ottawa Ph.D. Dissertation are based on analyses of the ACS Cancer Prevention Study (CPS II) cohort, a database to which you have been granted special access. Also, I note that you are a key co-author on all publications since 2009 that analyze the relationship between fine particulate matter (PM2.5) and mortality in the CPS II cohort. Most of these publications required that the authors agree to the four ICMJE “Uniform Requirements,” one of which is “Agreement to be accountable for all aspects of the work in ensuring that questions related to the accuracy or integrity of any part of the work are appropriately investigated and resolved.”

My March 28, 2017 [Dose-Response article](#) “Fine Particulate Matter and Total Mortality in Cancer Prevention Study Cohort Reanalysis” challenges the validity of the 2009 HEI Research Report 140, which you co-authored. Drs. Daniel Krewski and C. Arden Pope III, your primary Ph.D. Dissertation advisors, have not responded to my [April 10, 2017 email message](#). Indeed, they have refused to confirm or refute any of the results in my article and have not conducted the analyses that I originally requested in my [March 10, 2017 HEI email message](#).

Thus, as per the ICJME “Uniform Requirements,” I request that you conduct these analyses, which I restate here: “In order to test the validity of my evidence, I request that you conduct a sensitivity analysis that produces tables similar to the California tables presented with your [September 7, 2010 letter to CARB](#). Specifically, please produce tables which describe the PM2.5 and mortality relationship in the CSP II cohort for the Ohio Valley states (Indiana, Kentucky, Ohio, Pennsylvania, and West Virginia) and for the remainder of the Continental United States. Also, please produce these same tables using the 1979-1983 EPA IPN PM2.5 data, which I used in my [2005 Inhalation Toxicology article](#), instead of the PM2.5 data used in the 2000 and 2009 HEI Reports.”

Please email me the results of the requested analyses by June 10, 2017. I want to include these results in a special document that I am preparing for EPA, Congress, and all Americans regarding the lack of scientific integrity in PM2.5 epidemiology.

Thank you very much for your cooperation.

Sincerely yours,
James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.
UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute
jenstrom@ucla.edu