

From: "Jane Hall" <jhall@fullerton.edu>
To: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Subject: Re: Important Recent Developments Regarding CARB
Date: Sat, 28 Nov 2009 12:27:50 -0800

Please be aware that I made no such comments to Lois Henry, with whom I have never had any contact of any sort.

Best regards,

Jane V. Hall, Ph.D.
Professor of Economics
Co-Director Institute of Economic and Environmental Studies
California State University
Fullerton CA 92834
657 278 2236 Tel
657 278 3097 Fax

Date: Sat, 28 Nov 2009 12:02:36 -0800
To: "Jane Hall" <jhall@fullerton.edu>
From: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Subject: Important Recent Developments Regarding CARB

Dear Dr. Hall,

Since our correspondence in January regarding your "faith-based science" comments to Lois Henry, there have been a number of important developments regarding CARB that you should be aware of. To understand these developments, I recommend that you study the six items below, in the order shown.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.

November 19, 2009 CARB Legal Counsel Ellen Peter Statement & Related Statements Regarding CARB Employee Fraud (Hien Tran "Ph.D.")
(<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xtUxwxqtYoY>)

November 19, 2009 CARB Member John G. Telles Formal Statement Describing Tran Fraud and Proposing Suspension of CARB Truck Rule
(<http://www.youtube.com/user/CDTOA#p/a/u/2/yUAbJ8GeLUA>)

November 16, 2009 John G. Telles Letter to Ellen Peter and 11 exhibits regarding CARB Tran Fraud and CARB Truck Rule
(<http://www.box.net/shared/iqo6aygzl2>)

November 21, 2009 Bakersfield Californian Column by Lois Henry "Lies tarnish air boards credibility"
(<http://www.bakersfield.com/news/columnist/henry/x140060577/LOIS-HENRY-Lies-tarnish-air-boards-credibility>)

November 22, 2009 San Diego Union-Tribune Editorial "The air board's shame / Staff never revealed internal scandal before crucial vote"
(<http://www.signonsandiego.com/news/2009/nov/22/air-boards-shame-staff-never-revealed-internal-sca/>)

August 1, 2009 Enstrom Lecture (in four parts) at Forum on CARB Diesel Science in Ontario, CA
(<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ForumSummary080109.pdf>)
(<http://www.youtube.com/user/carboneofthisisreal>)
(<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/EnstromPPT080109.pdf>)

Date: Wed, 21 Jan 2009 17:04:22 -0800
To: "Jane Hall" <jhall@fullerton.edu>
From: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Subject: Important Request Regarding Lois Henry Blog

January 21, 2009

Jane V. Hall, Ph.D.
Professor of Economics
Institute of Economic and Environmental Studies
California State University, Fullerton
jhall@fullerton.edu

Dear Dr. Hall:

I am writing because the comments below appear on the Lois Henry Blog "noholdsbarred" (<http://people.bakersfield.com/home/Blog/noholdsbarred/39845#comments>). If you actually made these reckless and inaccurate comments, I respectfully request that you refrain from making any further comments of this nature if they involve me or my research. As a non-epidemiologist who has never published an epidemiologic study on the relationship between PM_{2.5} and mortality, you should be very careful about your comments on this subject. Both the "Medicare and Enstrom studies" are large, detailed, and peer-reviewed studies done by highly qualified epidemiologists. Although these studies are limited to elderly adults, they provide important evidence that there is no current relationship between PM_{2.5} and mortality in California. In addition, evidence from four other sources, involving adults of all ages, indicates no current relationship between PM_{2.5} and mortality in California. All of this evidence is described in my December 10, 2008 public comments regarding the CARB Statewide Truck and Bus Regulations (http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/truckbus08/897-carb_enstrom_comments_on_statewide_truck_regulations_121008.pdf). I strongly recommend that you carefully examine this evidence, none of which is cited in your November 13, 2008 report (http://business.fullerton.edu/centers/iees/reports/Benefits_of_Meeting_Clean_Air_Standards_11-13-08.pdf). Then, I recommend that you revise your report appropriately and submit it for peer-reviewed publication in a scientific journal, such as, *Environmental Health Perspectives*.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.
Jonsson Comprehensive Cancer Center
University of California, Los Angeles
<http://www.cancer.ucla.edu/>
jenstrom@ucla.edu

<http://people.bakersfield.com/home/Blog/noholdsbarred/39845#comments>

posted by [airqualityguy](#) on Jan 20, 2009 at 01:50 PM

Here is a response to Lois from Jane Hall who authored the Fullerton Study that Lois says is a bunch of hooley.

Well, this blog reflects what can only be called faith-based science - based on belief (however arrived at) and not science or empirical evidence. It is a classic case of finding what you look for, rather than looking for what is real. Decades of science have really laid to rest the question of whether or not air pollution increases the risk of death for some people and therefore contributes to early death - it clearly does. This reminds me of the tobacco "debate," wherein the nay-sayers became shriller as the evidence mounted and any doubts that tobacco smoke was a health hazard became deminimus. Similarly, repeated peer-review processes have arrived at statistical life methods and values as the appropriate way to assess the value of reducing risk to life. Even the best efforts of OMB over the past eight years have failed to change that.

More specifically, the Medicare and Enstrom studies both focus on the elderly. Their risk of death is already so high compared to the general population that any small risk added by air pollution is lost in the statistical analysis. Consequently, it is not appropriate to use those studies to assess risk of existing pollution levels to the general population. (And reference to them is a typical means to confuse the issue and obfuscate the actual risk.)

Jane V. Hall, Ph.D.
Professor of Economics
Co-Director Institute of Economic and Environmental Studies
California State University
Fullerton CA 92834
714 278 2236 Tel
714 278 3097 Fax