

Date: Thu, 5 Dec 2013 16:05:25 -0800
Subject: Re: "Response Op-Ed" re Nov 24 Morain Tribute to Froines
From: "Morain, Dan" <dmorain@sacbee.com>
To: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>

Do you feel a need to run this? I don't. Perhaps the fellow could write a letter to the editor.

Dan Morain
Editorial Page Editor
Sacramento Bee
916 321 1907
916 201 6281 - cell
dmorain@sacbee.com
Twitter @danielmorain

On Thu, Dec 5, 2013 at 3:46 PM, James E. Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu> wrote:

December 5, 2013

Gary Reed
Sunday Forum Editor
Sacramento Bee
greed@sacbee.com

Dear Mr. Reed,

I understand that it is Sac Bee policy to consider op-eds that respond to Sac Bee op-eds. Thus, I have provided below my 400-word "response op-ed" regarding the Dan Morain's November 24, 2013 [tribute](#) to John Froines. I have included several hyperlinks that provide details to support the statements that I have made. Please let me know if you have any questions or need additional information regarding my op-ed.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.
UCLA & Scientific Integrity Institute
jenstrom@ucla.edu
[\(310\) 472-4274](tel:(310)472-4274)

John Froines is the Ultimate California “Political” Scientist

I am responding to the misleading and inaccurate [tribute](#) paid to UCLA toxicologist John Froines on November 24, 2013 by Dan Morain. Due to limited space, I will focus only on Froines’ illegal and activist service on the CARB Scientific Review Panel on Toxic Air Contaminants ([SRP](#)). When he began serving on the newly created SRP in 1984 he already had a [reputation](#) as a “political” scientist who misused science to advance a political agenda. Froines was able to advance his agenda of environmental extremism in California largely because his initial 3-year SRP appointment was illegally extended into an almost 30-year reign, which ended this [July](#).

My 2008 [communications](#) with then UC President Robert Dynes revealed that Froines and the other eight SRP members had not been properly nominated for reappointment once their initial 3-year appointments expired. California Health and Safety Code (CHSC) [Section 39670](#) requires that the UC President nominate at least three qualified candidates for each appointment or reappointment. Specified legislators then made the final selection from the list of nominees. Froines obtained his original appointment from Assembly Speaker Willie Brown and he was reappointed by several Assembly Speakers who were not given any other nominees to select. A 2009 Pacific Legal Foundation [lawsuit](#) succeeded in ending the indefinite reappointments of CARB-favored scientists like Froines. These illegal reappointments have prevented objective California scientists from serving on the SRP.

The toxic air contaminant (TAC) determinations made by SRP have been largely based on Froines’ activist “[precautionary principle](#)” interpretation of epidemiologic and toxicological evidence. Consequently, diesel particulate matter, environmental tobacco smoke, formaldehyde, benzene, lead, chloropicrin, volatile organic compounds, and many other substances have been identified as TACs in California. However, much of the health effects evidence used in these SRP determinations does not apply to Californians, who live in a very healthy state.

These determinations have led to draconian CARB [regulations](#) that have adversely impacted entire industries in California, including trucking, construction, agriculture, and manufacturing. Froines has never acknowledged that the socioeconomic costs of compliance with these regulations, like unemployment and subsequent ill health, are greater than the claimed health benefits of compliance. Furthermore, in violation of CHSC [Section 39662](#), the SRP has refused to reverse any of its TAC decisions when new evidence shows no health effects and/or minimal human exposure.

Now that “political” scientist Froines is off the SRP, many of its TAC determinations should be challenged and objective scientists should make environmental health assessments in California.

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H., is an epidemiologist/physicist who has conducted epidemiologic research at UCLA since 1973. He is an expert on the health effects of air pollution in California.