

Date: Mon, 06 Aug 2012 09:04:12 -0700
To: "Dennis Yates" <dyates1329@aol.com>
From: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Subject: Follow-up re July 24 Meeting About SCAQMD & LA Fireplace Ban
Cc: "Robert Ulloa" <Trojan.ru@verizon.net>,
"Earl Elrod" <Earl.elrod@verizon.net>

August 6, 2012

Dear Mayor Yates,

I am following-up on my July 24, 2012 meeting with you, Bob Ulloa, and Earl Elrod at your Chino office regarding SCAQMD.

Regarding our conversation about a ban on wood burning fireplaces, I have determined that the City of Los Angeles currently has a complete ban on wood burning fireplaces in new residential construction as per AQMD Rule 445 (<http://www.aqmd.gov/rules/reg/reg04/r445.pdf>). This ban is contained in the 2011 Los Angeles Department of Building and Safety Green Building Code and 2012 CALGreen Supplement **FORM GRN 7** Rev 7-19-2012 "GREEN BUILDING CODE COUNTER PLAN CHECK NOTES for RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS UP TO SIX STORIES." Item 11 states "All new fireplaces must be direct-vent, sealed combustion type. Wood burning fireplaces are prohibited per AQMD Rule 445. (4.503.1, 9.503.1, AQMD Rule 445)" (http://ladbs.org/LADBSWeb/LADBS_Forms/PlanCheck/ResidentialCounter%28Form7%29.pdf).

AQMD Rule 445 was adopted at the March 7, 2008 AQMD Board Meeting (<http://www.aqmd.gov/hb/2008/March/080337a.html>). The "Proposed Rule 445 Wood Burning Devices" SYNOPSIS stated in part "The South Coast Air Basin exceeds health-based standards for PM2.5 and must demonstrate attainment by 2015. One of the strategies in the 2007 AQMP is a control measure to reduce fine particulate emissions from wood burning fireplaces and stoves." The Background for this proposal included the statement "Residents of the South Coast Air Basin are exposed to some of the highest ambient concentrations of fine particulate matter (also referred to as PM2.5) in the nation. A study by CARB estimated that elevated PM2.5 levels in the South Coast Air Basin result in 5,400 premature deaths per year based on 1999/2000 air quality data. Emissions from residential wood combustion contribute to PM2.5 levels in the South Coast Air Basin and to the regions exceedance of State and federal PM2.5 air quality standards. Due to the severity of the air quality problem in this region, the AQMD is required under State law (Health and Safety Code 39614) to adopt all feasible measures relative to other State programs to reduce particulate matter emissions from wood burning devices."

The Background statement "CARB estimated that elevated PM2.5 levels in the South Coast Air Basin result in 5,400 premature deaths per year" does not accurately reflect all the PM2.5 health effects evidence that existed as of March 7, 2008. For instance, I submitted my null 2005 PM2.5 mortality study to CARB on January 9, 2006 and it has been well known to CARB ever since (http://www.arb.ca.gov/planning/gmerp/dec1plan/gmerp_comments/enstrom.pdf). Overwhelmin

g epidemiologic evidence, both before and after March 7, 2008, indicates that there are NO "premature deaths" in California caused by PM2.5. Furthermore, as I stated in my June 4, 2012 Orange County Register comments, a strong case can be made that the current PM2.5 air quality standards are not applicable to California and the South Coast Air Basin. Thus, the Background statement that was used to justify AQMD Rule 445 is another example of serious misrepresentation of existing health effects evidence by Dr. Wallerstein. There is no public health justification for the current ban on wood burning fireplaces in Los Angeles.

I am currently preparing my public comments on the Draft 2012 Air Quality Management Plan (<http://www.aqmd.gov/aqmp/2012aqmp/index.htm>), which was released on July 19, 2012 (<http://www.aqmd.gov/news1/2012/AQMPdraftrelease.htm>). Please let me know how you plan to deal with my "**Charges of Falsification and Defamation by SCAQMD Executive Officer Barry Wallerstein.**"

Thank you very much for your interest and consideration.

Best regards,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.

Date: Wed, 11 Jul 2012 11:02:26 -0700
To: "Dennis Yates" <dyates1329@aol.com>
From: "James E. Enstrom" <jenstrom@ucla.edu>
Subject: Request for Meeting to Discuss SCAQMD AQMP
Cc: "Robert Ulloa" <Trojan.ru@verizon.net>, "Earl Elrod" <Earl.elrod@verizon.net>

July 11, 2012

Mayor Dennis Yates
SCAQMD Governing Board Member
dyates1329@aol.com

Dear Mayor Yates,

I have been an epidemiologist at UCLA since 1973 and I have conducted important research on the health effects of air pollution in California. I have substantial evidence that the health effects of air pollution in Southern California are being exaggerated by SCAQMD staff members. This evidence is described in the recent exchange in the Orange County Register that I had with Dr. Barry Wallerstein. Please read the OC Register links below, which are also contained in the attached PDF file.

In order to help you better understand the air pollution health effects evidence and its implications for the 2012 AQMD Air Quality Management Plan, I request a meeting with you and your AQMD Assistants Robert Ulloa and Earl Elrod, as soon as convenient.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Best regards,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.
UCLA School of Public Health
jenstrom@ucla.edu
(310) 825-2048 UCLA
(310) 210-7145 cell

cc: Robert Ulloa <Trojan.ru@verizon.net>
Earl Elrod <Earl.elrod@verizon.net>

June 20, 2012 Orange County Letter by James Enstrom "Excessive regulations = unemployment"

<http://letters.ocregister.com/2012/06/20/how-will-the-greater-good-be-determined/>

in response to

June 14, 2012 Orange County Letter by Barry Wallerstein "Fighting for our 'right to breathe'"

<http://letters.ocregister.com/2012/06/14/fighting-for-our-right-to-breathe/>

in response to

June 4, 2012 Orange County Register Reader Rebuttal (James Enstrom): Air pollution in L.A. region

<http://www.ocregister.com/opinion/air-357230-california-pollution.html>

in response to

April 25, 2012 Orange County Register Science Article by Pat Brennan "Smog report: L.A. region still among the nation's worst"

<http://sciencedude.ocregister.com/2012/04/25/smog-report-l-a-region-still-among-nations-worst/170814/>